Case 08-35653-KRH Doc 9231 Filed 11/09/10 Entered 11/09/10 18:30:47 Desc Main Document Page 1 of 20

**EDVA** 

B104 (FORM 104) (08/07)

ADVERSARY PROCEEDING NUMBER ADVERSARY PROCEEDING COVER SHEET (Court Use Only) (Instructions on Reverse) **PLAINTIFFS DEFENDANTS ATTORNEYS** (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone No.) **ATTORNEYS** (If Known) **PARTY** (Check One Box Only) **PARTY** (Check One Box Only) ☐ U.S. Trustee/Bankruptcy Admin □ Debtor □ Debtor ☐ U.S. Trustee/Bankruptcy Admin □ Creditor □ Other □ Creditor □ Other □ Trustee □ Trustee CAUSE OF ACTION (WRITE A BRIEF STATEMENT OF CAUSE OF ACTION, INCLUDING ALL U.S. STATUTES INVOLVED) NATURE OF SUIT (Number up to five (5) boxes starting with lead cause of action as 1, first alternative cause as 2, second alternative cause as 3, etc.) FRBP 7001(1) - Recovery of Money/Property FRBP 7001(6) – Dischargeability (continued) 11-Recovery of money/property - §542 turnover of property 61-Dischargeability - §523(a)(5), domestic support 68-Dischargeability - §523(a)(6), willful and malicious injury 12-Recovery of money/property - §547 preference 13-Recovery of money/property - §548 fraudulent transfer 63-Dischargeability - §523(a)(8), student loan ☐ 14-Recovery of money/property - other 64-Dischargeability - §523(a)(15), divorce or separation obligation (other than domestic support) FRBP 7001(2) - Validity, Priority or Extent of Lien 65-Dischargeability - other 21-Validity, priority or extent of lien or other interest in property FRBP 7001(7) – Injunctive Relief FRBP 7001(3) - Approval of Sale of Property 71-Injunctive relief – imposition of stay 31-Approval of sale of property of estate and of a co-owner - §363(h) 72-Injunctive relief – other FRBP 7001(4) - Objection/Revocation of Discharge FRBP 7001(8) Subordination of Claim or Interest 41-Objection / revocation of discharge - §727(c),(d),(e) 81-Subordination of claim or interest FRBP 7001(5) – Revocation of Confirmation FRBP 7001(9) Declaratory Judgment ☐ 51-Revocation of confirmation 91-Declaratory judgment FRBP 7001(6) - Dischargeability FRBP 7001(10) Determination of Removed Action 66-Dischargeability - §523(a)(1),(14),(14A) priority tax claims 01-Determination of removed claim or cause 62-Dischargeability - §523(a)(2), false pretenses, false representation, actual fraud Other 67-Dischargeability - §523(a)(4), fraud as fiduciary, embezzlement, larceny SS-SIPA Case – 15 U.S.C. §§78aaa et.seq. 02-Other (e.g. other actions that would have been brought in state court (continued next column) if unrelated to bankruptcy case) ☐ Check if this case involves a substantive issue of state law □ Check if this is asserted to be a class action under FRCP 23 □ Check if a jury trial is demanded in complaint Demand \$ Other Relief Sought

Case 08-35653-KRH Doc 9231 Filed 11/09/10 Entered 11/09/10 18:30:47 Desc Main Document Page 2 of 20

B104 (FORM 104) (08/07), Page 2

BANKRUPTCY CASE IN WHICH THIS ADVERSARY PROCEEDING ARISES				
NAME OF DEBTOR		BANKRUPTCY CASE NO.		
DISTRICT IN WHICH CASE IS PENDING		DIVISION OFFICE	NAME OF JUDGE	
RELATED A	DVERSARY F	PROCEEDING (IF ANY)		
PLAINTIFF	DEFENDANT		ADVERSARY PROCEEDING NO.	
DISTRICT IN WHICH ADVERSARY IS PENDIN	\G	DIVISION OFFICE	NAME OF JUDGE	
SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY (OR PLAINTIFF)				
DATE		PRINT NAME OF ATTORNE	Y (OR PLAINTIFF)	

#### INSTRUCTIONS

The filing of a bankruptcy case creates an "estate" under the jurisdiction of the bankruptcy court which consists of all of the property of the debtor, wherever that property is located. Because the bankruptcy estate is so extensive and the jurisdiction of the court so broad, there may be lawsuits over the property or property rights of the estate. There also may be lawsuits concerning the debtor's discharge. If such a lawsuit is filed in a bankruptcy court, it is called an adversary proceeding.

A party filing an adversary proceeding must also complete and file Form 104, the Adversary Proceeding Cover Sheet, \*unless the party files the adversary proceeding electronically through the court's Case Management/Electronic Case Filing system (CM/ECF). (CM/ECF captures the information on Form 104 as part of the filing process.) When completed, the cover sheet summarizes basic information on the adversary proceeding. The clerk of court needs the information to process the adversary proceeding and prepare required statistical reports on court activity.

The cover sheet and the information contained on it do not replace or supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, the Bankruptcy Rules, or the local rules of court. The cover sheet, which is largely self-explanatory, must be completed by the plaintiff's attorney (or by the plaintiff if the plaintiff is not represented by an attorney). A separate cover sheet must be submitted to the clerk for each complaint filed.

**Plaintiffs** and **Defendants.** Give the names of the plaintiffs and defendants exactly as they appear on the complaint.

**Attorneys.** Give the names and addresses of the attorneys, if known.

Party. Check the most appropriate box in the first column for the plaintiffs and the second column for the defendants.

**Demand.** Enter the dollar amount being demanded in the complaint.

**Signature.** This cover sheet must be signed by the attorney of record in the box on the second page of the form. If the plaintiff is represented by a law firm, a member of the firm must sign. If the plaintiff is pro se, that is, not represented by an attorney, the plaintiff must sign.

\*Per LBR 7003-1, in the EDVA, a properly completed Adversary Proceeding Cover Sheet is required.

Jeffrey N. Pomerantz, Esq. Andrew W. Caine, Esq. (admitted *pro hac vice*)

PACHULSKI STANG ZIEHL & JONES LLP 10100 Santa Monica Boulevard

Los Angeles, California 90067-4100 Telephone: (310) 277-6910

Telephone: (310) 277-6910 Telecopy: (310) 201-0760

- and -

Robert J. Feinstein, Esq. John A. Morris, Esq. (admitted *pro hac vice*) PACHULSKI STANG ZIEHL & JONES LLP 780 Third Avenue, 36<sup>th</sup> Floor

New York, New York 10017 Telephone: (212) 561-7700 Telecopy: (212) 561-7777

Counsel to the Liquidating Trustee

Lynn L. Tavenner, Esq. (VA Bar No. 30083) Paula S. Beran, Esq. (VA Bar No. 34679) TAVENNER & BERAN, PLC 20 North Eighth Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Richmond, Virginia 23219 Telephone: (804) 783-8300

Telecopy: (804) 783-0178

### IN THE UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA RICHMOND DIVISION

In re:	) Case No. 08-35653 (KRH)
CIRCUIT CITY STORES, INC., et al.,	) Chapter 11
Debtors.	) (Jointly Administered)
ALFRED H. SIEGEL, AS TRUSTEE OF THE CIRCUIT CITY STORES, INC. LIQUIDATING TRUST,	) ) ) Adv. Pro. No. 10)
Plaintiff,	)
v.	)
NETGEAR INC.,	)
Defendant.	) )

THE LIQUIDATING TRUSTEE'S COMPLAINT TO AVOID AND RECOVER PREFERENTIAL TRANSFERS AND RECOVER OTHER AMOUNTS OWING TO THE ESTATE AND OBJECTION TO CLAIM NOS. 6264

Alfred H. Siegel, the duly appointed trustee of the Circuit City Stores, Inc.

Liquidating Trust (the "Trustee"), pursuant to the Second Amended Joint Plan of Liquidation of Circuit City Stores, Inc. and its Affiliated Debtors and Debtors in Possession and its Official Committee of Creditors Holding General Unsecured Claims (the "Plan"), for his complaint and for his objection to proof of claim number 6264 (the "Complaint") against Netgear Inc. ("Defendant"), alleges as follows:

#### NATURE OF THE ACTION

1. The Trustee brings this action against Defendant to recover amounts due and owing from Defendant to Circuit City arising from the relationship between the parties. In addition to contractual claims, the Trustee seeks recovery for unjust enrichment and to avoid and recover certain preferential transfers that occurred during the 90-day period prior to the commencement of Circuit City's bankruptcy proceedings, as well as turnover of property of the bankruptcy estates. Finally, the Trustee objects to Defendant's proofs of claim filed against the Debtors' estates.

#### THE PARTIES

2. The Trustee ("Trustee" or "Plaintiff") is the duly appointed trustee of the Circuit City Stores, Inc. Liquidating Trust (the "Trust"). Pursuant to Articles II and III of the Trust Agreement, the Trustee has the sole authority to pursue claims transferred to the Trust by the Debtors through the Plan, and to litigate objections to claims asserted against the Debtors' estates.

- 3. Prior to the Effective Date of the Plan, Circuit City Stores, Inc. and its affiliated debtors in possession (collectively "Circuit City" or the "Debtors")<sup>1</sup> were corporations that maintained their respective principal places of business in the locations set forth below, and were the debtors in the above-captioned chapter 11 bankruptcy cases.
- 4. Upon information and belief, defendant Netgear, Inc. is a corporation organized under the laws of the State of Delaware with its principal place of business in San Jose, California.

# **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

- 5. This Court has jurisdiction to consider this matter under 28 U.S.C. §§ 157 and 1334.
  - 6. This is a core proceeding under 28 U.S.C. § 157(b).
- 7. Venue of these chapter 11 cases and this adversary proceeding in this district and before this Court is proper under 28 U.S.C. §§ 1408 and 1409.
- 8. The statutory and legal predicates for the relief requested by the Complaint are sections 105, 502, 503, 541, 542, 547, 550, and 558 of title 11, United States Code (the "Bankruptcy Code"), Bankruptcy Rules 3007 and 7001, and Local Bankruptcy Rule 3007-1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Debtors and the last four digits of their respective taxpayer identification numbers are as follows: Circuit City Stores, Inc. (3875), Circuit City Stores West Coast, Inc. (0785), InterTAN, Inc. (0875), Ventoux International, Inc. (1838), Circuit City Purchasing Company, LLC (5170), CC Aviation, LLC (0841), CC Distribution Company of Virginia, Inc. (2821), Circuit City Properties, LLC (3353), Kinzer Technology, LLC (2157), Abbott Advertising Agency, Inc. (4659), Patapsco Designs, Inc.(6796), Sky Venture Corp. (0311), PRAHS, Inc.(n/a), XSStuff, LLC (9263), Mayland MN, LLC (6116), Courchevel, LLC (n/a), Orbyx Electronics, LLC (3360), and Circuit City Stores PR, LLC (5512). The address for Circuit City Stores West Coast, Inc. is 9250 Sheridan Boulevard, Westminster, Colorado 80031. For all other Debtors, the address was 9950 Mayland Drive, Richmond, Virginia 23233 and currently is 4951 Lake Brook Drive, Glen Allen, VA 23060.

#### PERTINENT FACTS

### A. General Case Background

- 9. On November 10, 2008 (the "Petition Date"), the Debtors filed voluntary petitions in this Court for relief under chapter 11 of the Bankruptcy Code, and until the effective date of the Plan, continued to operate as debtors in possession pursuant to Bankruptcy Code sections 1107 and 1108.
- 10. On November 12, 2008, the Office of the United States Trustee for the Eastern District of Virginia appointed a statutory committee of unsecured creditors (the "Creditors' Committee").
- 11. On January 16, 2009, the Court authorized the Debtors to, among other things, conduct going out of business sales at all of the Debtors' retail locations (the "Stores") pursuant to an agency agreement (the "Agency Agreement") between the Debtors and a joint venture, as agent (the "Agent"). On January 17, 2009, the Agent commenced going out of business sales at the Stores pursuant to the Agency Agreement. As of March 8, 2009, the going out of business sales at the Debtors' stores were completed.
- 12. On August 9, 2010, the Debtors and the Creditors' Committee filed the Plan, which provides for the liquidation of the Debtors' assets and distribution of the proceeds thereof under chapter 11 of the Bankruptcy Code.
- 13. On September 10, 2010, the United States Bankruptcy Court, Eastern District of Virginia, signed an Order confirming the Plan.
  - 14. The Plan became effective on November 1, 2010 (the "Effective Date").

# B. The Business Relationship Between Circuit City And Defendant

- 15. Prior to the commencement of these bankruptcy cases, the Debtors were a leading specialty retailer of consumer electronics and operated large nationwide electronics stores that sold, among other things, televisions, home theatre systems, computers, camcorders, furniture, software, imaging and telecommunications products, and other audio and video electronics.
- 16. During the course of the parties' relationship, the parties engaged in numerous transactions, that are reflected in, among other things, invoices, communications and other documents (collectively, the "Defendant's Agreements").
- 17. Circuit City purchased goods from the Defendant pursuant to the Defendant's Agreements.
- 18. Circuit City and Defendant conducted business with one another up to and through the Petition Date, and thereafter, under the Defendant's Agreements.
- 19. During the ordinary course of the Debtors' business, the Debtors maintained books and records of their transactions with Defendant (the "Books and Records").

# C. <u>Amounts Allegedly Owed To Defendant And Defendant's Proofs Of Claim</u>

#### (1) Claim No. 6224

- 20. On or about January 26, 2009, Defendant filed Claim No. 6264.
- 21. Claim No. 6264 was filed (i) in the amount of \$1,000,322.52 as a general unsecured, non-priority claim (the "General Unsecured Claim").
- 22. The General Unsecured Claim was filed on account of goods and services allegedly provided by Defendant to Circuit City prior to the Petition Date.

#### D. Amounts Owed To Circuit City By Defendant

23. As of the date hereof, on account of the pre- and post-petition business conducted between Defendant and Circuit City pursuant to the Defendant's Agreements or otherwise, Defendant is indebted to Circuit City on account of the following unpaid obligations (the "Unpaid Obligations") in at least the following amounts:

TOTAL	\$1,398,051.20
Returns	\$211,891.98
Billbacks	\$465,239.52
Chargebacks	\$720,919.70

- 24. The Unpaid Obligations are due, owing, and payable by Defendant to Circuit City.
- On or about February 15, 2010 Circuit City made demand for the UnpaidObligations, but Defendant has not complied, and has not paid any portion of the UnpaidObligations.
- 26. Upon information and belief, approximately \$1,162,447.54 of the Unpaid Obligations are on account of prepetition obligations owed to Circuit city by Defendant (the "Prepetition Unpaid Obligations").

# E. <u>Transfers To Defendant Made Within 90 Days Prior To</u> The Petition Date

- 27. During the 90-day period prior to the commencement of Circuit City's bankruptcy cases (the "Preference Period"), Circuit City transferred property to or for the benefit of Defendant in an amount not less than \$2,196,112.55. A list identifying each and every transfer during the Preference Period is attached hereto as <u>Exhibit A</u> and incorporated herein by reference (collectively, the "Preferential Transfers").
- 28. Plaintiff acknowledges that some of the Preferential Transfers might be subject to defenses under Bankruptcy Code section 547(c), for which the Defendant bears the

DOCS NY:22465.1

burden of proof under Section 547(g). Plaintiff will work with Defendant to exchange applicable information in an effort to resolve any and all factual issues with respect to potential defenses.

#### **COUNT I**

### AVOIDANCE OF PREFERENTIAL TRANSFERS PURSUANT TO 11 U.S.C. § 547(b)

- 29. The Trustee repeats and realleges each of the allegations set forth above as if fully set forth herein.
- 30. During the Preference Period, Defendant was a creditor of one or more of the Debtors.
- 31. Each Preferential Transfer identified on Exhibit A hereto was made to or for the benefit of Defendant.
- 32. Each Preferential Transfer was made for or on account of an antecedent debt or debts owed by one or more of the Debtors before such Preferential Transfers were made.
  - 33. Each Preferential Transfer was made during the Preference Period.
  - 34. Each Preferential Transfer was made while the Debtors were insolvent.
- 35. Each Preferential Transfer enabled Defendant to receive more than Defendant would have received if (i) the Debtors' chapter 11 cases were instead cases under chapter 7 of the Bankruptcy Code; (ii) the transfers and/or payments had not been made; and (iii) Defendant received payment on account of the debt paid by the Preferential Transfers to the extent provided by the Bankruptcy Code.
- 36. Each Preferential Transfer constitutes an avoidable preference pursuant to Bankruptcy Code section 547(b).

#### **COUNT II**

# RECOVERY OF PREFERENTIAL TRANSFERS PURSUANT TO 11 U.S.C. § 550

- 37. The Trustee repeats and realleges each of the allegations set forth above as if fully set forth herein.
- 38. Defendant was either (i) the initial transferee of the Preferential Transfers, (ii) the entity for whose benefit the Preferential Transfers were made, or (iii) an immediate or mediate transferee of the Preferential Transfers.
- 39. Each Preferential Transfer that is avoided under Section 547(b) is recoverable pursuant to Bankruptcy Code section 550.
- 40. Subject to potential defenses, the Trustee is entitled to recover the value of the Preferential Transfers pursuant to Bankruptcy Code section 550(a).

#### **COUNT III**

#### **BREACH OF CONTRACT**

- 41. The Trustee repeats and realleges each of the allegations set forth above as if fully set forth herein.
- 42. Pursuant to the Defendant's Agreements, Defendant is obligated to pay to the Debtors the Unpaid Obligations.
- 43. The Defendant's Agreements are valid and enforceable agreements against Defendant.
- 44. The Debtors performed their obligations under the Defendant's Agreements with respect to the Unpaid Obligations.

- 45. Defendant's failure to compensate the Debtors for the Unpaid Obligations in an amount not less than \$1,398,051.20 constitutes a material breach of Defendant's obligations under the Defendant's Agreements.
- 46. As a direct and proximate result of Defendant's breaches, the Debtors incurred damages in an amount not less than \$1,398,051.20.
- 47. Accordingly, the Trustee is entitled to a judgment against Defendant in an amount not less than \$1,398,051.20.

#### **COUNT IV**

#### UNJUST ENRICHMENT/QUASI CONTRACT

- 48. The Trustee repeats and realleges each of the allegations set forth above as if fully set forth herein.
- 49. In the alternative to Count III, but without waiving any allegation with respect thereto, the Trustee makes the following additional allegations in support of Count IV.
- 50. The Debtors conferred a benefit upon Defendant pursuant to the Defendant Agreements, by Failing to pay or reimburse the Debtors for chargebacks, billbacks and warranty obligations owed by Defendant to the Debtors.
  - 51. Defendant knowingly accepted the benefit conferred by the Debtors.
- 52. The Debtors reasonably expected to be compensated by Defendant in an amount not less than \$1,398,051.20 on account of the benefit conferred upon Defendant.
- 53. Defendant's receipt of benefit without just compensation to the Debtors has unjustly enriched Defendant in an amount not less than \$1,398,051.20.
- 54. The Trustee has no adequate remedy at law to recover the Unpaid Obligations.

55. Accordingly, as a result of Defendant's unjust enrichment at the Debtors' expense, the Trustee is entitled to restitution from the Defendant in an amount not less than \$1,398,051.20.

#### **COUNT V**

#### TURNOVER OF PROPERTY PURSUANT TO 11 U.S.C. § 542

- 56. The Trustee repeats and realleges each of the allegations set forth above as if fully set forth herein.
- 57. In the alternative to Counts III and IV, but without waiving any allegation with respect thereto, the Trustee makes the following additional allegations in support of Count V.
- 58. Defendant is in possession, custody, and control of the Unpaid Obligations in an amount not less than \$1,398,051.20.
  - 59. Defendant is not a custodian for the Unpaid Obligations.
- 60. The Unpaid Obligations constitute valid and existing debts, due and owing by Defendant to the Debtors.
- 61. The Unpaid Obligations are property of the Debtors' estates under section 541 of the Bankruptcy Code and constitute debts that are matured, payable on demand, or payable on order.
- 62. Despite being requested to do so, Defendant has not turned over or paid to Circuit City the Unpaid Obligations.
- 63. Accordingly, pursuant to Bankruptcy Code section 542, Defendant should be compelled to immediately turn over and deliver to the Trustee the Unpaid Obligations in an amount not less than \$1,398,051.20.

#### **COUNT VI**

#### **ACCOUNT STATED**

- 64. The Trustee repeats and realleges each of the allegations set forth above as if fully set forth herein.
- 65. One or more of the Debtors rendered invoices to the Defendant in the total amount of \$1,398,051.20.
  - 66. Defendant has failed to pay the outstanding amount of \$1,398,051.20.
- 67. An account has been stated between the Debtor(s) which rendered the invoices and the Defendant whereby Defendant is indebted to such Debtor(s) in the total amount of \$1,398,051.20.
- 68. Despite demand therefore, said sums remain unpaid, and the Trustee is entitled to judgment against Defendant in the amount of \$1,398,051.20, plus interest.

#### **COUNT VII**

#### OBJECTION TO CLAIM 6264 – DISALLOWANCE UNDER SECTION 502(d)

- 69. The Trustee repeats and realleges each of the allegations set forth above as if fully set forth herein.
- 70. Claim No. 6264 assert a right to payment allegedly owed by one or more of the Debtors.
- 71. As alleged above, each Preferential Transfer constitutes an avoidable preference pursuant to Bankruptcy Code section 547(b), which is recoverable pursuant to Bankruptcy Code section 550.
- 72. Accordingly, pursuant to Bankruptcy Code section 502(d), Claim No.
  6264 must be disallowed unless and until Defendant pays to the Trustee an amount equal to each
  Preferential Transfer that is avoided.

#### **COUNT VIII**

#### **OBJECTION TO CLAIM NO. 6264 AS OVERSTATED**

- 73. The Trustee repeats and realleges each of the allegations set forth above as if fully set forth herein.
- 74. After a thorough review of the Debtors' Books and Records, the Trustee has determined that Claim No. 6264 is unwarranted/overstated by \$234.20. In particular, the Trustee has determined that Claim No. 6264 fails to account for reconciling adjustments and/or provide proper credits to Circuit City.
- 75. As a result, Defendant's Claim No. 6264 should be disallowed in its entirety/reduced to an amount not to exceed \$1,000,038.32.

#### **COUNT IX**

# OBJECTION TO CLAIM NO. 6264 – SETOFF OF THE PREPETITION UNPAID OBLIGATIONS

- 76. The Trustee repeats and realleges each of the allegations set forth above as if fully set forth herein.
- 77. In the alternative to Counts III, IV and V, but without waiving any allegation with respect thereto, the Trustee makes the following additional allegations in support of Count IX.
- 78. The Prepetition Unpaid Obligations arose from business transactions between the Debtors and Defendant.
- 79. The Prepetition Unpaid Obligations is based on debts owed by Defendant to the Debtors.
- 80. Claim No. 6264 also arose from business transactions between Defendant and the Debtors, and is a debt allegedly owed by the Debtors to Defendant.

- 81. Consequently, under applicable law, the Debtors have established valid setoff rights.
- 82. Pursuant to Bankruptcy Code section 558, the Debtors' defenses, including setoff, are preserved.
- 83. Under applicable law, the Prepetition Unpaid Obligations should be setoff first against Claim No. 6264.
  - 84. After setoff, Claim No. 6264 should be reduced to \$0.
- 85. After setoff, the Prepetition Unpaid Obligations should be reduced to \$162,409.22, and, the Unpaid Obligations should be reduced to \$398,012.88 (the "Remaining Unpaid Obligations") on account of pre- and postpetition obligations of Defendant to the Debtors.

## **PRAYER FOR RELIEF**

WHEREFORE, the Trustee respectfully requests and prays that the Court:

- i. Pursuant to Counts I and II, enter judgment against Defendant under 11 U.S.C. §§ 547 and 550 and allow the Trustee to avoid and recover the Preferential Transfers in an amount not less than \$2,196,112.55; and
- ii. Pursuant to Count III, enter judgment against Defendant for breach of contract and award the Trustee damages in an amount not less than \$1,398,051.20; and
- iii. In the alternative to Count III, pursuant to Count IV, enter judgment against Defendant for unjust enrichment and award Circuit City restitution damages on account of Defendant's unjust enrichment in an amount not less than \$1,398,051.20; and
- iv. In the alternative to Counts III and IV, pursuant to Count V, order Defendant to immediately turn over and deliver to the Trustee the Unpaid Obligations in an amount not less than \$1,398,051.20; and
- v. In the alternative to Counts III, IV and V, pursuant to Count VI, enter judgment against Defendant for an account stated and award the Trustee damages in an amount not less than \$1,398,051.20; and

- vi. Pursuant to Count VII, disallow Claim No. 6264 in accordance with Bankruptcy Code section 502(d) pending payment by Defendant to the Trustee of any avoidable and recoverable transfers; and
- vii. Pursuant to Count VIII, reduce Claim No. 6264 from the overstated amount of \$1,000,322.52 to the proper amount of \$1,000,038.32; and
- viii. In the alternative to Counts III, IV, V and VI, pursuant to Count IX, authorize the Trustee to effect a setoff of the Prepetition Unpaid Obligations against Claim No. 6264, reducing Claim No. 6264 to the proper amount of \$0 and the amount of the Unpaid Obligations to \$398,012.88; and
- ix. Award the Trustee prejudgment interest at the legally allowed applicable rate;
  - x. Award the Trustee costs, and expenses of suit herein; and
- xi. Grant the Trustee such other and further relief the Court deems just and appropriate.

Dated: Richmond, Virginia November 9, 2010 TAVENNER & BERAN, PLC

/s/ Lynn L. Tavenner\_

Lynn L. Tavenner (VA Bar No. 30083) Paula S. Beran (VA Bar No. 34679) 20 North Eighth Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Richmond, Virginia 23219 (804) 783-8300

- and -

PACHULSKI STANG ZIEHL & JONES LLP Jeffrey N. Pomerantz, Esq. Andrew W. Caine, Esq. 10100 Santa Monica Boulevard Los Angeles, California 90067-4100 (310) 277-6910

- and -

Robert J. Feinstein, Esq. John A. Morris, Esq. PACHULSKI STANG ZIEHL & JONES LLP 780 Third Avenue, 36<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, New York 10017 (212) 561-7700

Counsel to the Liquidating Trustee

# **EXHIBIT A**

# (Preferential Transfers)

	Transaction	Check		Transaction
Vendor name	Date	Number	Invoice ID	Amount
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	412566	\$ 53,345.95
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	414288	\$ 34,020.52
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	413377	\$ 31,784.09
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	413376	\$ 24,058.81
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	412968	\$ 20,123.93
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	413727	\$ 19,850.79
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	412347	\$ 19,700.02
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	412549	\$ 9,001.77
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	414289	\$ 8,358.79
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	412537	\$ 6,394.31
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	413709	\$ 6,001.18
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	412326	\$ 5,115.45
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	VPCREDAPR2008	\$ 4,494.27
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	412333	\$ 1,500.30
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	409316	\$ 1,278.86
NETGEAR INC	8/19/2008	1033768	409315	\$ 331.56
NETGEAR INC	8/21/2008	1033859	414376	\$ 202,029.70
NETGEAR INC	8/21/2008	1033859	414377	\$ 86,998.11
NETGEAR INC	8/21/2008	1033859	414557	\$ 74,674.95
NETGEAR INC	8/21/2008	1033859	414558	\$ 72,951.86
NETGEAR INC	8/21/2008	1033859	414378	\$ 49,640.96
NETGEAR INC	8/21/2008	1033859	414556	\$ 38,890.45
NETGEAR INC	8/21/2008	1033859	414379	\$ 23,249.56
NETGEAR INC	8/21/2008	1033859	414560	\$ 21,364.47
NETGEAR INC	8/21/2008	1033859	414559	\$ 8,168.77
NETGEAR INC	8/27/2008	1034093	415105	\$ 11,370.37
NETGEAR INC	8/27/2008	1034093	415312	\$ 11,325.74
NETGEAR INC	8/27/2008	1034093	415083	\$ 7,641.87
NETGEAR INC	9/3/2008	1034191	416045	\$ 52,224.47
NETGEAR INC	9/3/2008	1034191	416352	\$ 32,020.71
NETGEAR INC	9/3/2008	1034191	416044	\$ 27,282.13
NETGEAR INC	9/3/2008	1034191	415672	\$ 25,932.67
NETGEAR INC	9/3/2008	1034191	416349	\$ 24,848.31
NETGEAR INC	9/3/2008	1034191	414561	\$ 16,838.63
NETGEAR INC	9/5/2008	1034408	417267	\$ 77,441.40
NETGEAR INC	9/5/2008	1034408	417271	\$ 41,779.71
NETGEAR INC	9/5/2008	1034408	417269	\$ 35,330.09
NETGEAR INC	9/5/2008	1034408	417489	\$ 30,339.18
NETGEAR INC	9/5/2008	1034408	416822	\$ 26,870.72
NETGEAR INC	9/5/2008	1034408	417268	\$ 24,868.22
NETGEAR INC	9/5/2008	1034408	417270	\$ 22,219.47

NETGEAR INC	9/8/2008	1034562	417748	\$	7,331.78
NETGEAR INC	9/10/2008	1034636	417926	\$	73,111.32
NETGEAR INC	9/11/2008	1034739	418714	\$	39,692.86
NETGEAR INC	9/11/2008	1034739	418955	\$	30,106.10
NETGEAR INC	9/11/2008	1034739	418712	\$	28,730.70
NETGEAR INC	9/11/2008	1034739	418713	\$	20,079.84
NETGEAR INC	9/11/2008	1034739	418237	\$	4,918.63
NETGEAR INC	9/11/2008	1034739	418693	\$	1,639.54
NETGEAR INC	9/11/2008	1034739	418951	\$	1,639.54
NETGEAR INC	9/11/2008	1034739	418694	\$	1,639.54
NETGEAR INC	9/11/2008	1034739	418692	\$	983.73
NETGEAR INC	9/17/2008	1035044	419528	\$	50,768.35
NETGEAR INC	9/17/2008	1035044	419529	\$	33,882.65
NETGEAR INC	9/18/2008	1035150	420067	\$	45,407.86
NETGEAR INC	9/18/2008	1035150	420524	\$	31,346.75
NETGEAR INC	9/18/2008	1035150	420523	\$	30,237.48
NETGEAR INC	9/18/2008	1035150	420066	\$	28,638.67
NETGEAR INC	9/22/2008	1035386	421090	\$	85,314.45
NETGEAR INC	9/22/2008	1035386	421095	\$	47,022.85
NETGEAR INC	9/22/2008	1035386	421094	\$	28,190.58
NETGEAR INC	9/22/2008	1035386	421093	\$	28,102.75
NETGEAR INC	9/22/2008	1035386	421091	\$	22,271.17
NETGEAR INC	9/22/2008	1035386	421092	\$	18,289.69
NETGEAR INC	9/24/2008	1035442	421625	\$	7,795.20
NETGEAR INC	9/24/2008	1035442	421630	\$	5,568.00
NETGEAR INC	9/24/2008	1035442	421629	\$	5,568.00
NETGEAR INC	9/24/2008	1035442	421627	\$	3,340.80
NETGEAR INC	9/24/2008	1035442	421626	\$	2,784.00
NETGEAR INC	9/24/2008	1035442	421628	\$	1,670.40
NETGEAR INC	10/2/2008	1035908	1000000181	\$	14,451.54
NETGEAR INC	10/2/2008	1035908	1000000183	\$	9,501.77
NETGEAR INC	10/2/2008	1035908	1000000180	\$	8,227.08
NETGEAR INC	10/2/2008	1035908	1000000184	\$	6,998.69
NETGEAR INC	10/2/2008	1035908	1000000182	\$	5,458.47
NETGEAR INC	10/2/2008	1035908	1000000209	\$	878.00
NETGEAR INC	10/2/2008	1035908	1000000206	\$	702.40
NETGEAR INC	10/2/2008	1035908	1000000213	\$	526.80
NETGEAR INC	10/2/2008	1035908	1000000208	\$	351.20
NETGEAR INC	10/2/2008	1035908	1000000207	\$	175.60
NETGEAR INC	10/9/2008	1036253	1000000814	\$	44,529.83
NETGEAR INC	10/9/2008	1036253	1000000816	\$	25,552.18
NETGEAR INC	10/9/2008	1036253	1000000818	\$	24,362.60
NETGEAR INC	10/9/2008	1036253	1000000815	\$	23,500.83
NETGEAR INC	10/9/2008	1036253	1000000850	\$	21,792.33
NETGEAR INC	10/9/2008	1036253	1000000813	\$	16,147.91
NETGEAR INC	10/9/2008	1036253	1000000817	\$	15,218.95
Total	. 5, 3, 2500		. 5 5 5 5 5 6 7 7		2,196,112.55
		l		<b>*</b>	_, , <b></b>

Case 08-35653-KRH Doc 9231 Filed 11/09/10 Entered 11/09/10 18:30:47 Desc Main Document Page 20 of 20